



AGENDA SUMMARY REPORT

SUBJECT:

Consideration of Mendocino Transit Authority Salary Parity Study
Human Resource Director - John Pegan

SUMMARY:

History of the Parity Study of 2012

The Governing Board contracted with DWL Transit Consulting for a Wage/Benefits Parity Study that was presented to the Board in a Summary Report dated May 3, 2012. This year, the Board requested an update on the Parity Study. DWL used 2011 data bases with 2010-2011 data. After an initial review of 20 potential comparable agencies, DWL reduced the comparable agencies to 9, as set out below.

Important Considerations

There are several essential points to consider:

- (a) Some of the agencies are county or city employees,
- (b) some are combined county or city employees using contractors or sub-contractors,
- (c) others are just contractors or sub-contractors.
- (d) Many of the classifications or positions do not correlate across agencies, and I had to extrapolate comparable duties – especially in administration.
- (e) All of this severely skews the comparable data – both for the original study and the parity update requested by the Board.
- (f) Using contractors for services can increase the cost, for instance using a cleaning company for shelter or bus cleaning.
- (g) Conversely, using contractors and sub-contractors for drivers can eliminate many benefits and lowers salaries of workers.
- (h) Using county or city employees can skew the costs upward in benefits and the job duties may be different than from a dedicated in-house agency such as MTA.

Conclusions of the update on the parity study

- (a) Management and administration positions are underpaid and have lower benefits than comparable jurisdictions.
- (b) Represented positions tend to be at comparable pay.
- (c) The exception is in the area of benefits for all classifications.
- (d) Some of the classifications such as Dispatch – do not seem to carry the same duties, with our Dispatch performing multiple functions.
- (e) Some classifications, such as Shelter or Bus Cleaner – appear to be contracting services for which the agency is paying for multiple services, whereas MTA's classifications are simpler and in-house.

Comparable agencies per the May 3, 2012 Party Report

The 2011 Peer Review Report used 9 comparable jurisdictions for its salary and benefit total compensation review and report.

1. El Dorado Transit = All employees are in-house: management, maintenance, transit, & paratransit. Has CalPERS, does not seem that the employer contributes to employee pension, but uncertain. Does not appear to participate in Social Security per 2017 data.
2. Humboldt Transit Authority = Management, Maintenance & Transit employees are in-house. CalPERS. Employer pays 100% of pension contribution. Does not appear to contribute to employee's Social Security as of 2012. Para-Transit is mixed – contracted out to City Ambulance.
3. Lake Transit = All operations and maintenance are contracted out. Management is also contracted out – part-time. No CalPERS – just private party social security. No Contribution to Employee's SS payment.
4. Napa Vine= Management and Admin staff are Napa County employees with CalPERS. Employees contribute 8% to their pension contributions. All operations, transit, para-transit and maintenance positions are contracted to private party = no CalPERS. No contribution to employee's SS contribution.
5. Placer County Transit = combination. Covered employees have CalPERS. Employer pays 99% of pension contribution. But transit services seem to be contracted out. Participates in Social Security. It appears to pay the employee's entire SS contribution.
6. San Luis Obispo Regional Transit Agency = All employees: management, admin, maintenance, operations, transit, para transit are In-House as RTA employees. As of 2011 SLORTA is not a member of CalPERS. Participates in Social Security. Pays 60% of the employee's SS contribution.
7. Santa Rosa City Bus = Management, Transit and maintenance employees are in-house employees of the City of Santa Rosa = CalPERS. Does not contribute to employees' social security. Employer pays 100% of pension contribution. Para-Transit services are contracted out to private party.
8. Sonoma County Transit = Only management and admin staff are in-house as County employees on Sonoma County 1937 Act public pension. All other employees: operations, maintenance, transit and para-transit are contracted out to one of 3 separate private contractors = NO CalPERS or pension. No contribution to employees' social security portion.
9. Stanislaus Regional Transit = Only Management and Admin staff are in-house as County employees = 1937 Act County pension. Uncertain if County pays any portion of employees' pension contribution. All other positions: operations, maintenance, transit and para-transit are all contracted out to a single private party. Does not appear to contribute to employee's Social Security.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

No Action Required. Discussion Only.

ATTACHMENTS:

Salary Parity Spreadsheet

Agenda Item 10 - Salary

Parity

	MTA CURRENT WAGE MATRIX		Peer Group median with CPI increases compounded to		95% match to peer group's median		
	Step A	Step F	Entry	Top Level	Step A	Step F	
	2018	2018	2018	2018	95% to median match		
Management	(1) General Manager	\$ 101,404.97	\$ 129,422.92	\$ 120,267.51	\$ 145,264.35	\$ 114,254.13	\$ 138,001.13
	(1) Operations Manager	\$ 37.92	\$ 50.02	\$ 40.92	\$ 54.80	\$ 38.88	\$ 52.06
	(1) Chief Fiscal Officer	\$ 33.45	\$ 44.13	\$ 46.29	\$ 52.50	\$ 43.98	\$ 49.87
	(1) Human Resources Director	\$ 33.45	\$ 44.13	\$ 46.29	\$ 52.50	\$ 43.98	\$ 49.87
	(1) Marketing & Planning Manager	\$ 33.45	\$ 44.13	\$ 34.70	\$ 51.78	\$ 32.97	\$ 49.19
	(1) Maintenance Manager	\$ 37.92	\$ 50.02	\$ 43.24	\$ 48.24	\$ 41.08	\$ 45.83
	Operations	Dial-A-Ride /Operations Supervisor	\$ 23.68	\$ 31.23	\$ 25.28	\$ 34.36	\$ 24.02
Operations Supervisor		\$ 23.68	\$ 31.23	\$ 22.80	\$ 35.27	\$ 21.66	\$ 33.51
Training Supervisor (Lead Trainer)		\$ 23.68	\$ 31.23	\$ 25.96	\$ 30.12	\$ 24.67	\$ 28.61
(1) Transportation Superintendent		\$ 28.40	\$ 37.47	\$ 45.75	\$ 56.96	\$ 43.46	\$ 54.11
Dispatchers & Dial-A-Ride Dispatchers		\$ 18.75	\$ 23.93	\$ 16.92	\$ 19.00	\$ 16.08	\$ 18.05
Dispatchers - Bilingual		\$ 20.18	\$ 25.75	\$ 23.93	\$ 28.90	\$ 22.74	\$ 27.46
Assistant Dispatcher		\$ 16.09	\$ 20.54	\$ 19.08	\$ 23.05	\$ 18.13	\$ 21.90
Dial-A-Ride Operators				\$ 15.11	\$ 20.57	\$ 14.35	\$ 19.54
Transit Vehicle Operators		\$ 17.86	\$ 22.79	\$ 16.77	\$ 21.86	\$ 15.93	\$ 20.77
Substitute Drivers		\$ 17.86	\$ 22.79	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -
Trainer		\$ 19.61	\$ 25.03	\$ 21.24	\$ 24.39	\$ 20.18	\$ 23.17
Administration	Finance Assistant	\$ 24.79	\$ 32.68	\$ 33.02	\$ 40.42	\$ 31.37	\$ 38.40
	Human Resources Assistant	\$ 24.79	\$ 32.68	\$ 33.02	\$ 40.42	\$ 31.37	\$ 38.40
	Cash Counter	\$ 17.86	\$ 22.79	\$ 19.56	\$ 20.78	\$ 18.58	\$ 19.75
	Marketing & Planning Assistant	\$ 24.79	\$ 32.68	\$ 35.64	\$ 43.03	\$ 33.86	\$ 40.87
	Mobility Management Coordinator	\$ 24.79	\$ 32.68	\$ 35.07	\$ 42.06	\$ 33.32	\$ 39.96
	Bilingual Receptionist	\$ 15.28	\$ 20.15	\$ 17.66	\$ 22.63	\$ 16.77	\$ 21.50
	Administrative Secretary	\$ 19.44	\$ 25.66	\$ 26.09	\$ 28.70	\$ 24.79	\$ 27.27
	Administrative Assistant IV	\$ 25.95	\$ 33.12	\$ 30.78	\$ 37.17	\$ 29.24	\$ 35.32
	Administrative Assistant III	\$ 20.22	\$ 25.81	\$ 23.98	\$ 28.97	\$ 22.78	\$ 27.52
	Administrative Assistant II	\$ 15.78	\$ 20.15	\$ 18.72	\$ 22.62	\$ 17.78	\$ 21.49

MAINTENANCE	Administrative Assistant I	\$ 12.31	\$ 15.71	\$ 14.60	\$ 17.63	\$ 13.87	\$ 16.75
	Mechanic	\$ 25.54	\$ 32.59	\$ 23.33	\$ 33.86	\$ 22.16	\$ 32.16
	Mechanics Helper	\$ 19.73	\$ 25.19	\$ 15.87	\$ 20.35	\$ 15.08	\$ 19.34
	Shelter Maintenance Cleaner	\$ 16.98	\$ 21.67	\$ 24.39	\$ 28.78	\$ 23.17	\$ 27.34
	Cleaner	\$ 14.20	\$ 18.12	\$ 17.05	\$ 17.73	\$ 16.20	\$ 16.85
	Lead Mechanic	\$ 28.09	\$ 35.86	\$ 25.66	\$ 37.24	\$ 24.38	\$ 35.38

(1) Exempt Position

Approximate average increase in salaries:	1.186011986	1.122400468	1.126711387	1.066280445
---	-------------	-------------	-------------	-------------